

The Society of St. Catherine of Siena

Conference

Ever directed toward the Lord . . .

The Love of God in the Liturgy of the Eucharist past, present, and hoped for

Merton College, Oxford, Friday 28th October 2005
Blackfriars Oxford, Saturday 29th October 2005

In October 2004 Pope John Paul II declared a ‘year of the Eucharist’, enjoining the Christian faithful to “rediscover the gift of the Eucharist as light and strength for your daily lives”.¹ Elsewhere Pope John Paul II has spoken of how in the Eucharist “the eyes of the Church are always turned toward the Lord present in the Sacrament of the Altar”,² drawing attention to the way in which the Lord becomes manifest in the Holy Eucharist, in the liturgy which is itself the “summit toward which all the activity of the Church is directed and at the same time the fount from where all [Christ’s] strength flows out”.³ John Paul II’s successor, Benedict XVI, has confirmed the decision to convene the Synod on the Eucharist, confirming that the Church’s understanding of the Eucharist and her Sacred Liturgy are her very vitality.

The Society of St. Catherine of Siena has sought by various means to mark the year of the Eucharist with further study of the Sacred Liturgy. Although we recognised time was short, it seemed appropriate to call a group of scholars together for common study of the Liturgy, especially the Liturgy of the Holy Eucharist, to consider a number of questions in a scholarly colloquium, and to present the fruits of those discussions in a public conference and through publication.

This is a time of energetic and fruitful reflection by scholars and the lay faithful on the character of the pre- and post-Conciliar reforms, following on from the seminal conference on the Sacred Liturgy held in Oxford in 1996 by the Centre for Faith and Culture.⁴ The emergence of a number of Anglophone studies on the history and character of liturgical reform itself,⁵ together with documents from the Vatican Curia,⁶ and discussion in scholarly

¹ John Paul II, Apostolic Letter *Mane nobiscum Domine*, §30.

² John Paul II, Encyclical Letter of 17th April 2003 *Ecclesia de Eucharistia*, §1 “Ecclesiae oculi semper in Dominum intenduntur in Altaris Sacramento praesentem.”

³ Vatican II, Constitution on the Sacred Liturgy *Sacrosanctum Concilium*, 4th December 1963. “Liturgia est culmen ad quod actio ecclesiae tendit et simul fons unde omnis eius virtus emanat”.

⁴ The proceedings were published as Caldecott, S. (ed.), *Beyond the Prosaic: Renewing the Liturgical Movement*, Edinburgh, T & T Clark, 1998. A group from that conference subsequently issued the ‘Oxford Declaration’ (see appendix).

Just for a few examples: Nichols OP, A., *Looking at the Liturgy: A Critical View of its Contemporary Form*, San Francisco, Ignatius, 1996; Reid OSB, A., *The Organic Development of the Liturgy*, Farnborough, St. Michael’s Abbey Press, 2004; Pristas, L., *The Theological Principles That Guided the Redaction of the Roman Missal (1970)* in *The Thomist*, Vol. 67 (2003), pp. 157–195 and *The Orations of the Vatican II Missal: Policies for Revision* in *Communio*, Vol. 30 (Winter 2003), pp. 621–653; Lang *cong. orat.*, U. M., *Turning Towards the*

and more popular circles,⁷ and the draft (2003) English translation of the third Typical Edition of the *Missale Romanum* (2000) put out for consultation by ICEL, all indicate concern with the structure and character of the current and future celebration of the Roman Rite. As part of this reflection, the Society is at the same time aware of increasing interest in the pre-Conciliar rites, and the large numbers of lay faithful devotedly attached to their celebration. The Holy Father, in his extensive writings on the Sacred Liturgy over a number of years, has often emphasised the importance of this scholarly discussion.

In this conference we would like to consider the question of the future of the Roman Rite: both as the Church presently struggles to reflect on the character of liturgical expression after the Second Vatican Council; and reflecting the concerns of those attached to the pre-Conciliar rite. The Society is not seeking to adopt a ‘position’ or seek a ‘solution’ to the current situation of the liturgy in the life of the Church – neither advocating further development of the existing reform, nor a wholesale return to the pre-Conciliar rite, nor ‘reform of the reform’. Conclusions like these are beyond our competence: rather we would like to include discussion of the philosophical and historical issues surrounding the Sacred Liturgy, and we would also like to include ecumenical contributors, as a way of developing and bringing out into the open questions which all must address in considering the Sacred Liturgy.

Following our very successful colloquium on the Encyclical Letter *Ecclesia de Eucharistia* held at Heythrop College in 2004, the Society believes it is timely to gather together a group of scholars to mark the end of the Year of the Eucharist, and to initiate and foster what might become more regular meetings (not necessarily organised by us alone) of scholars and theologians of diverse viewpoints concerned with these liturgical questions. We would want this discussion to be marked by the intellectual generosity and hospitality customary at gatherings of the Society.

Professor Eamon Duffy of the University of Cambridge has agreed to open the Conference, pointing up the continuity of the questions he and others raised in 1996 with the questions still pressing to be addressed. Professor Lauren Pristas has accepted an invitation to speak, as has Fr. Jonathan Robinson and Professor Paul Bradshaw. The other speakers will be from the Society. We have had a strong expression of support for the conference from Archbishop Vincent Nichols of the Birmingham Archdiocese, who will attend the conference for part of the first and all of the second day.

Lord: Orientation in Liturgical Prayer, San Francisco, Ignatius, 2004 (being Fr. Lang’s own translation of his study *Conversi ad Dominum: zu Geschichte und Theologie der christlichen Gebetsrichtung* [*Neue Kriterien*, 5], Freiburg, Johannes Verlag, 2003).

⁶ Cf. Congregation for Divine Worship and the Discipline of the Sacraments: *Liturgiam authenticam* of March 28th, 2001; *Redemptionis Sacramentum* of March 25th, 2004.

⁷ Cf. for instance the conference at Heythrop College organised by Fr. Cameron-Mowat SJ on the fortieth anniversary of *Sacrosanctum Concilium* in 2003; the Society of St. Catherine of Siena’s joint conference with the Margaret Beaufort Institute of Theology *Ite, Missa Est! Transubstantiation and Living Eucharist* at the Divinity Faculty in Cambridge University in 2002 (with papers published in the *Heythrop Journal*, Vol. 44, October 2003). See also articles in *The Tablet* by Archbishop Rembert Weakland in 2002 and Bishop Michael Evans in 2005 and the forthcoming conference in 2005 of the Catholic Theological Association on the Eucharist. See also: the article of Cameron-Mowat SJ, A., *Polarisation and Liturgy in Priests and People*, October 2004 and the reply by Hemming L. P., *A Reply to Fr. Cameron-Mowat in The Pastoral Review* (formerly *Priests and People*), January 2005 with an extended discussion in *Mass of Ages*, February 2005; and even Widdecombe, the Hon. A., *The Mass is a Mess*, London, The Keys, 2004.

Structure of the Conference

The Conference will take place over two days during the Oxford Michælmass term, with encouragement for students, especially research students, to attend on the second day.

On the first day, Merton College, Oxford

A small, scholarly event of between sixteen and twenty scholars, reflecting a range of opinions around a theme connected with the history of the reform of the Roman Rite and the impact of that reform especially on the laity, beginning with a solemn Mass and concluding with a formal dinner. As happened at the conference organised in 1996, we have permission for Mass on the first day of the conference to be in the pre-Conciliar rite.

After Mass and a brief lunch there will be two sessions of the colloquium, each lasting about an hour and a half, punctuated by tea. The first session of the colloquium will concentrate on historical questions; the second on philosophical questions. The papers of the main speakers will be circulated in advance, together with other material (it is hoped, for instance to provide each participant with a copy of Fr. Robinson's forthcoming book on the philosophical questions behind the development of the Roman Rite). Each participant is invited, if they wish, to offer a short (five minute maximum) formal presentation during each of the two sessions (the speakers for Saturday will not be required to offer formal presentations). A small number of research students may be present at the colloquium.

In the evening a formal dinner will follow, where we will be joined by the Archbishop of Birmingham and other guests of the Society. The dinner will be addressed by Fr. Ronald Creighton-Jobe *cong. orat.*, and there may be an informal presentation and discussion after dinner.

Attendees:

Rev'd. Professor Paul Bradshaw, University of Notre Dame (London Campus)
Mr. Stratford Caldecott, Oxford Centre for Faith and Culture
Rev'd Nicolas du Chaxel FSSP
Professor Eamon Duffy, Faculty of Divinity, University of Cambridge
Mr. John Eidinow, Bodley Fellow, Dean, and College Lecturer, Merton College, Oxford
Very Rev'd. Cassian Folsom OSB, Pontifical Liturgical Institute of Sant'Anselmo
Mgr. Bruce Harbert, ICEL
Rev'd. Dr. Laurence Hemming, Heythrop College, University of London
Rev'd. Dr. Simon Jones, Chaplain of Merton College, Oxford
Rev'd. Dr. U. Michael Lang *cong. orat.*, London Oratory
Dr. Francesca Murphy, University of Aberdeen
Mr. Cyrus Olsen, Regent's Park College, University of Oxford
Dr. Susan Parsons, Society of St. Catherine of Siena
Rev'd. Dr. Richard Price, Heythrop College, University of London
Professor Lauren Pristas, Caldwell College, New Jersey
Rev'd. Professor Patrick Regan, OSB, Pontifical Liturgical Institute of the Sant'Anselmo
Rev'd. Dr. Alcuin Reid OSB, Farnborough Abbey
Very Rev'd. Dr. Jonathan Robinson *cong. orat.*, Toronto Oratory
Rev'd. Professor John Saward, International Theological Institute, Gaming

Rev'd. Andrew Wadsworth, Chaplain to the Society of St. Catherine of Siena
Dr. Clare Watkins, Margaret Beaufort Institute of Theology, Cambridge

On the Second Day, a subscription conference open to the public at Blackfriars, Oxford

A conference with an opening address; four major papers, some with short (five minute) replies; and a concluding session summing up the conference and providing some opportunity for presentation of issues raised in the previous day's colloquium that have not otherwise been raised. There will be opportunities for questions and discussion from the floor in each session. The day will be preceded by a Sung Mass offered in the chapel of Blackfriars by the Archbishop of Birmingham. The conference will end with a drinks reception.

The speakers for the second day

Conference Opening:	Professor Eamon Duffy
Speaker 1	Very Rev'd. Dr. Jonathan Robinson <i>cong. orat.</i>
Speaker 2	Professor Lauren Pristas
Speaker 3	Rev'd. Dr. Laurence Hemming
Speaker 4	Rev'd. Professor Paul Bradshaw
Conclusion	Dr. Susan Parsons

Members of the public attending the second day will be charged £25 (£15 for students and members of the Friends of the Society of St. Catherine of Siena). There will be no charge for participants who have been invited to the Colloquium on Friday, but it is expected that colloquium participants will want to attend the Saturday event. Publicity will go out for the public event in the national Catholic press (*Tablet* and *Catholic Herald*) in early Summer and early Autumn.

The Society of St. Catherine of Siena is able to arrange this conference in association with Blackfriars, Oxford, and through the generosity of a number of benefactors, who so far include: The Friends of the Society of St. Catherine of Siena; St. Benet's Hall, Oxford; Mrs. Linda Helm; SCM-Canterbury Press Ltd; The Latin Mass Society; Prince Rupert zu Löwenstein; Anthony Short & Partners (Ashbourne); Mr. Duncan Gaillie; other sponsors are also being sought.

Conference Schedule

Colloquium – Friday 28th October – Merton College

11.00 am	Mass at Blackfriars, Oxford
12.30 pm	Lunch (provided by Merton College)
1.15 pm	Session I: The Liturgy and History
3.00 pm	Tea
3.30	Session II: The Liturgy and Philosophy
5.15 pm	Break
6.00 pm	Anglican Evensong sung by the Choir of Merton College
6.45 pm	Drinks reception with choir and some Fellows of the College
7.30 pm	Dinner
9.00 pm	Informal presentation

Day Conference – Saturday 29th October – Blackfriars, Oxford

9.00 am	Registration in Aula
9.45 am	Mass
10.30 am	Professor Eamon Duffy (Susan Parsons to chair)
11.00 am	Fr. Jonathan Robinson <i>cong. orat.</i> (Fr. Michael Lang <i>cong. orat.</i> to chair)
12.00 pm	Break
12.15 pm	Professor Lauren Pristas (Rev. Simon Jones to chair)
1.15 pm	Lunch
2.00 pm	Professor Paul Bradshaw (Dr. Clare Watkins to chair)
3.00 pm	Break
3.15 pm	Dr. Laurence Hemming (Mr. John Eidinow to chair)
4.15 pm	Tea
4.45 pm	Susan Parsons (Rev'd Dr. Alcuin Reid OSB to chair)
5.15 pm	Discussion (close at 5.45 pm) (Rev'd. Dr. Alcuin Reid OSB to chair)

Drinks Reception for speakers and guests

Appendix — The Oxford Declaration (1996)

1. Reflecting on the history of liturgical renewal and reform since the Second Vatican Council, the Liturgy Forum agreed that there have been many positive results. Among these might be mentioned the introduction of the vernacular, the opening up of the treasury of the Sacred Scriptures, increased participation in the liturgy and the enrichment of the process of Christian initiation. However, the Forum concluded that the preconciliar liturgical movement as well as the manifest intentions of *Sacrosanctum Concilium* have in large part been frustrated by powerful contrary forces, which could be described as bureaucratic, philistine and secularist.

2. The effect has been to deprive the Catholic people of much of their liturgical heritage. Certainly, many ancient traditions of sacred music, art and architecture have been all but destroyed. *Sacrosanctum Concilium* gave pride of place to Gregorian chant (n. 116), yet in many places this "sung theology" of the Roman liturgy has disappeared without trace. Our liturgical heritage is not a superficial embellishment of worship but should properly be regarded as intrinsic to it, as it is also to the process of transmitting the Catholic faith in education and evangelization. Liturgy cannot be separated from culture; it is the living font of a Christian civilization and hence has profound ecumenical significance.

3. The impoverishment of our liturgy after the Council is a fact not yet sufficiently admitted or understood, to which the necessary response must be a *revival of the liturgical movement* and the initiation of a new cycle of reflection and reform. The liturgical movement which we represent is concerned with the enrichment, correction and resacralisation of Catholic liturgical practice. It is concerned with a renewal of liturgical eschatology, cosmology and aesthetics, and with a recovery of the sense of the sacred - mindful that the law of worship is the law of belief. This renewal will be aided by a closer and deeper acquaintance with the liturgical, theological and iconographic traditions of the *Christian East*.

4. The revived liturgical movement calls for the promotion of the *Liturgy of the Hours*, celebrated in song as an action of the Church in cathedrals, parishes, monasteries and families, and of *Eucharistic Adoration*, already spreading in many parishes. In this way, the Divine Word and the Presence of Christ's reality in the Mass may resonate throughout the day, making human culture into a dwelling place for God. At the heart of the Church in the world we must be able to find that loving contemplation, that adoring silence, which is the essential complement to the spoken word of Revelation, and the key to active participation in the holy mysteries of faith (*Oriente Lumen*, n. 1).

5. We call for a greater *pluralism* of Catholic rites and uses, so that all these elements of our tradition may flourish and be more widely known during the period of reflection and *ressourcement* that lies ahead. If the liturgical movement is to prosper, it must seek to rise above differences of opinion and taste to that unity which is the Holy Spirit's gift to the Body of Christ. Those who love the Catholic tradition in its fullness should strive to *work together in charity*, bearing each other's burdens in the light of the Holy Spirit, and persevering in prayer with Mary the Mother of Jesus.

6. We hope that any future liturgical reform would not be imposed on the faithful but would proceed, with the utmost caution and sensitivity to the *sensus fidelium*, from a thorough understanding of the organic nature of the liturgical traditions of the Church (Cf. *Sacrosanctum Concilium*, n. 23). Our work should be sustained by prayer, education and study. This cannot be undertaken in haste, or in anything other than a serene spirit. No matter what difficulties lie ahead, the glory of the Paschal Mystery - Christ's love, his cosmic sacrifice and his childlike trust in the Father - shines through every Catholic liturgy for those who have eyes to see, and in this undeserved grace we await the return of spring.